

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

X
In Re Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001

: FINAL ORDER AND
: JUDGMENT ON
: COMPENSATORY DAMAGES

:
:
:
:
1:03 MDL 1570 (GBD)(SN)

X

This Document Relates to
Hoglan v. Iran
1:11-cv-07550 (GBD)(SN)

WHEREAS, evidence as to liability in this matter was submitted by Plaintiffs in filings with this Court on July 10, 2015;

WHEREAS, a hearing on liability was held on August 17, 2015, at which evidence was presented, including the evidence previously submitted by Plaintiffs in *Havlisch, et al. v. bin Laden, et al.*, 03-cv-09848 (GBD)(FM) on May 19, 2011, July 13, 2011, August 19, 2011, and December 15, 2011, in addition to supplemental evidence filed with this Court, including extensive evidence filed confidentially under seal, and the July 10, 2015 evidence referenced above, all of which was admitted into evidence in this case;

WHEREAS, on August 31, 2015, this Court entered Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and further, on that same date, issued an Order of Judgment based on such Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the evidence presented in support thereof, and the entire record in this case, thereby entering final judgment as to liability in favor of Plaintiffs and against the following Defendants:

1. Islamic Republic of Iran;
2. Ayatollah Ali Hoseini-Khamenei;

3. Ali Akbar Hashemi Rafsanjani;
4. Iran's Ministry of Information and Security;
5. Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps;
6. Iran's Ministry of Petroleum;
7. National Iranian Oil Corporation;
8. National Iranian Tanker Corporation;
9. National Iranian Gas Company;
10. National Iranian Petrochemical Company;
11. Iran's Ministry of Commerce;
12. Iran's Ministry of Economic Affairs and Finance;
13. Iran's Ministry of Defense and Armed Forces Logistics;
14. Iran Airlines;
15. Central Bank of Iran; and,
16. Hezbollah;

WHEREAS, United States Magistrate Judge Sarah Netburn issued Reports and Recommendations on October 12, 2016, October 14, 2016, October 24, 2016, and August 8, 2017, with regard to the award of damages;

WHEREAS, this Court adopted these four Reports and Recommendations in Orders dated October 31, 2016, June 21, 2017, and November 17, 2017, respectively;

WHEREAS, this Court entered Partial Final Judgments dated October 31, 2016, June 21, 2017, and November 17, 2017;

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs have requested that a single Final Judgment with regard to compensatory damages and prejudgment interest for all of the successful Plaintiffs, and naming

each of the liable Defendants, be entered in this case, for purposes of clarity for any judgment enforcement action;

It is HEREBY

ORDERED that the final compensatory damages judgment is entered in favor of Plaintiffs, comprised of the thirteen (13) Decedent's Estate Plaintiffs and the two hundred, three (203) Individual Family Members Plaintiffs listed in this Order and Judgment, and against all sixteen (16) Defendants listed above; and, it is FURTHER

ORDERED that such Plaintiffs are awarded: (1) economic compensatory damages to the thirteen (13) Decedent's Estate Plaintiffs in the aggregate amount of \$469,465,035, as more specifically set forth below; (2) compensatory damages for pain and suffering of \$2,000,000 per Decedent's Estate Plaintiff for a total of \$26,000,000, as more specifically set forth below; (3) compensatory damages for solatium to the Individual Family Members Plaintiffs totaling \$1,346,375,000, as more specifically set forth herein below; and, (4) prejudgment interest on the amount of \$1,372,375,000 awarded herein for compensatory pain and suffering and solatium damages from September 11, 2001, to the date of judgment at the rate of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually; and, it is FURTHER

ORDERED that each and every one of the Defendants is jointly and severally liable for the entire JUDGMENT on compensatory damages; and, it is FURTHER

ORDERED that Plaintiffs' request for punitive damages is DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE to being considered in conjunction with the same issue in other cases in the multi-district litigation captioned *In Re: Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001*, 1:03 MDL 1570 (GBD)(SN); and, it is FURTHER

ORDERED that the economic compensatory damages and non-economic compensatory damages awarded to the thirteen (13) Decedent's Estate Plaintiffs are as follows:

DECEDENT	ECONOMIC LOSS	PAIN & SUFFERING	TOTAL AWARD
Estate of Siew Nya Ang	\$7,407,342	\$2,000,000	\$9,407,342
Estate of Mark Kendall Bingham	\$7,617,663	\$2,000,000	\$9,617,663
Estate of Joyce Ann Carpeneto	\$1,926,378	\$2,000,000	\$3,926,378
Estate of Wayne T. Davis	\$9,388,123	\$2,000,000	\$11,388,123
Estate of Timmy Grazioso	\$307,289,003	\$2,000,000	\$309,289,003
Estate of LeRoy W. Homer, Jr.	\$9,281,150	\$2,000,000	\$11,281,150
Estate of Hweidar Jian	\$10,108,875	\$2,000,000	\$12,108,875
Estate of Leon Lebor	\$747,568	\$2,000,000	\$2,747,568
Estate of Christopher E. Lunder	\$34,961,894	\$2,000,000	\$36,961,894
Estate of Joseph D. Mistrulli	\$4,999,143	\$2,000,000	\$6,999,143
Estate of Louis Nacke	\$8,185,357	\$2,000,000	\$10,185,357
Estate of Sandra Wright-Cartledge	\$1,132,626	\$2,000,000	\$3,132,626
Estate of Marc Scott Zeplin	\$66,419,913	\$2,000,000	\$68,419,913
TOTAL	\$469,465,035	\$26,000,000	\$495,465,035;

AND IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that compensatory damages for solatium for the Individual Family Members Plaintiffs are awarded as follows:

DECEDENT	PLAINTIFF	RELATIONSHIP	SOLATIUM
Mark Kendall Bingham	Alice Hoglan <i>a/k/a</i> Hoagland	Parent	\$8,500,000
Siew Nya Ang	Kui Liong Lee	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Siew Nya Ang	Winnee Lee	Child	\$8,500,000
Siew Nya Ang	Jeanee Lee	Child	\$8,500,000
Michael Bane	Arline Peabody-Bane	Step-Parent	\$4,250,000
Michael Bane	Brian Major	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Michael Bane	Brenda E. Jobe	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Joyce Ann Carpento	Joseph Carpento	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Dian Dembinski	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Loretta Haines	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Stephen Bradish	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Jack Bradish	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Sandra Wright Cartledge	Geraldine Deborah Spaeter	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter Chirchirillo	Nicholas Chirchirillo	Child	\$8,500,000
Peter Chirchirillo	Michael Chirchirillo	Child	\$8,500,000
Jeffrey Coale	JoanAnn Coale	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jeffrey Coale	Leslie Coale Brown	Sibling	\$4,250,000

Daniel M. Coffey	Jeanette Coffey	Parent	\$8,500,000
Daniel M. Coffey	Estate of Daniel F. Coffey, Jr.	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jason Coffey	Colleen McDonald	Fiancee	\$12,500,000
Jeffrey Collman	Estate of Beverly Sutton	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jeffrey Collman	Carolyn Sutton	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeffrey Collman	Vicki Lynn Michel	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeffrey Collman	Keith Bradkowski	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Jeffrey Collman	Kathryn Collman	Step-Parent	\$4,250,000
Jeffrey Collman	Charles Gengler	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Jeffrey Collman	Steven Gengler	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Jeffrey Collman	Susan Bohan	Step-Sibling	\$2,125,000
Wayne T. Davis	Tanya Davis	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Wayne T. Davis	Gabrielle Hunter Davis	Child	\$8,500,000
Wayne T. Davis	Malachai Roarke Davis	Child	\$8,500,000
Wayne T. Davis	Noverta Davis-Dean	Parent	\$8,500,000
Michael Diehl	Jason Diehl	Child	\$8,500,000
Michael Diehl	Jeannette Diehl	Child	\$8,500,000
Judy Fernandez	Emma Fernandez Regan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Judy Fernandez	Cirilo Fernandez	Parent	\$8,500,000
Judy Fernandez	Richard Fernandez	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Ronald Gamboa	Renee L. Gamboa	Parent	\$8,500,000
Ronald Gamboa	Estate of Ranulf Gamboa	Parent	\$8,500,000
Ronald Gamboa	Maria Joule	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Ronald Gamboa	Rachel G. Malubay	Sibling	\$4,250,000
William Godshalk	James Bond Godshalk	Parent	\$8,500,000
William Godshalk	Jane G. Haller	Sibling	\$4,250,000
William Godshalk	Aleese Hartmann	Fiancee	\$12,500,000
John Grazioso	Kathryn Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Kristen Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Michael Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Sandra Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000
John Grazioso	Carolee Azzarello	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Grazioso	Karen Ventre	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Grazioso	Krysty Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timmy Grazioso	Deborah Grazioso	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Sandra Grazioso	Parent	\$8,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Carolee Azzarello	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timmy Grazioso	Lauren Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Briana Grazioso	Child	\$8,500,000
Timmy Grazioso	Karen Ventre	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timmy Grazioso	Krysty Grazioso	Sibling	\$4,250,000
James Halvorson	Douglas Halvorson	Child	\$8,500,000
James Halvorson	Estate of Evelyn Halvorson	Parent	\$8,500,000

James Halvorson	Kate Halvorson	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Donald J. Havlish	Michaela Havlish	Child	\$8,500,000
Donald G. Havlish	Lea Michaela Bitterman	Step-Child	\$8,500,000
Donald G. Havlish	Sean Bitterman	Step-Child	\$8,500,000
James Jeffery Hobin	Derrick Hobin	Child	\$8,500,000
LeRoy W. Homer, Jr.	Melodic Homer	Spouse	\$12,500,000
LeRoy W. Homer, Jr.	Laurel Homer	Child	\$8,500,000
Hweidar Jian	Ju-Hsui Jian	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Hweidar Jian	William Jian	Child	\$8,500,000
Hweidar Jian	Kevin Jian	Child	\$8,500,000
Donald W. Jones	Audrey R. Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000
Donald W. Jones	John R. Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000
Donald W. Jones	Robert A. Jones	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Donald W. Jones	Candy Moyer	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanette LaFond-Menchino	Anita Koronsky	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanette LaFond-Menchino	Dina LaFond	Parent	\$8,500,000
Denis Lavelle	Estate of Emily Lavelle	Parent	\$8,500,000
Denis Lavelle	Patricia Caloia	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Denis Lavelle	Barbara Dziadek	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Denis Lavelle	Kathleen Palacio	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Denis Lavelle	Paul Lavelle	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Leon Lebor	Bessie Lebor	Parent	\$8,500,000
Leon Lebor	Barbara Lurman	Child	\$8,500,000
Leon Lebor	Joy a.k.a Rina Kaufman	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Robert Levine	Stephanie Giglio	Child	\$8,500,000
Catherine Lisa LoGuidice	Estate of Carmello Joseph LoGuidice	Parent	\$8,500,000
Joseph Lostrango	Joseph Lostrango, Jr.	Child	\$8,500,000
Joseph Lostrango	Cathryn Lostrango	Child	\$8,500,000
Joseph Lostrango	James Lostrango	Parent	\$8,500,000
Christopher E. Lunder	Karen Lunder	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Noell Maerz	Erich Maerz	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Mary Melendez	Ramon Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Ricky Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Jesse Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Tyler Melendez	Child	\$8,500,000
Mary Melendez	Florence Rosario	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Mary Melendez	Margaret Montanez	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Peter C. Milano	Child	\$8,500,000
Peter T. Milano	Jessica Milano	Child	\$8,500,000
Peter T. Milano	Alfred Milano	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Frank Milano	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Peter T. Milano	Maurcen Racioppi	Sibling	\$4,250,000

Peter T. Milano	Thomas Milano	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Philomena Mistrulli	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	MaryAnn Mistrulli	Child	\$8,500,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Joseph Mistrulli	Child	\$8,500,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Angela Mistrulli Cantone	Child	\$8,500,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Ann Mistrulli	Parent	\$8,500,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Maria Lambert	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joesph D. Mistrulli	Johnny Mistrulli	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Yvette Moreno	Rolando Ruben Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Yvette Moreno	Leiana Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Yvette Moreno	Noelia Moreno	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Louis Nacke	Amy Martinez	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Brian Nunez	Eric Nunez	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Brian Nunez	Neal Green	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Salvatore T. Papasso	Theresa Papasso	Parent	\$8,500,000
Salvatore T. Papasso	Salvatore Papasso	Parent	\$8,500,000
Salvatore T. Papasso	Vincent Papasso	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Perry	James Perry	Parent	\$8,500,000
John Perry	Joel R. Perry	Sibling	\$4,250,000
John Perry	Janice Perry	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Claudia Stallworth	Parent	\$8,500,000
Marsha Ratchford	Reginald Simpson	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Roosevelt Stallworth	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Carl Stallworth	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Cynthia Watts	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Angela Stallworth-Blunt	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Brian Christian	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marsha Ratchford	Amanda Rogers	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Gary Reiss	Parent	\$8,500,000
Joshua Reiss	Adam Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Jordan Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Jonathan Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Joshua Reiss	Jennifer Reiss	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Elvin Romero	Estate of Carmen Romero	Parent	\$8,500,000
Elvin Romero	Issac Romero	Parent	\$8,500,000
Elvin Romero	Diana Diaz	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Richard Rosenthal	Estate of Evan Rosenthal	Child	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Seth Rosenthal	Child	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Estate of Leonard Rosenthal	Parent	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Estate of Florence Rosenthal	Parent	\$8,500,000
Richard Rosenthal	Audrey Model	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Maria Theresa Santillan	Victor Santillan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Maria Theresa Santillan	Raymond Santillan	Sibling	\$4,250,000

Victor Saracini	Kirsten Saracini	Child	\$8,500,000
Victor Saracini	Brielle Saracini	Child	\$8,500,000
Scott Schertzer	Lori Brody	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Scott Schertzer	Ellen Schertzer	Parent	\$8,500,000
Hagay Shefi	Roy-Yetkutiel Shefi	Child	\$8,500,000
Hagay Shefi	Naomi-Ruth Shefi	Child	\$8,500,000
Paul K. Sloan	Patricia Sloan	Parent	\$8,500,000
Paul K. Sloan	Matt Sloan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Paul K. Sloan	Sarah Funk	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Raymond Smith, Jr.	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Carl Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Kevin Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Korry Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Tanya Warren	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Latrice Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Elaine Smith	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Christine Jackson	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Barbara Hargrove	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Estate of Deborah Sallad	Sibling	\$4,250,000
George Smith	Estate of Marion Thomas	Grandparent	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Timothy P. Soulas, Jr.	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Andrew J. Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Christopher Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Matthew Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Nicole Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Daniel Soulas	Child	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Frederick Soulas	Parent	\$8,500,000
Timothy Soulas	Stephen Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Frederick Soulas III	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Dan Soulas	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Soulas	Michelle Donlan	Sibling	\$4,250,000
William Steiner	Darren Steiner	Child	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Jordan Steiner	Child	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Meridith Reverdito	Child	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Estate of Wilma Steiner	Parent	\$8,500,000
William Steiner	Robert Steiner	Sibling	\$4,250,000
William Steiner	George Steiner	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Andrew Stergiopoulos	Kathleen Stergiopoulos	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Andrew Stergiopoulos	George Stergiopoulos, Jr.	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Edward W. Straub	Aaron Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Jonathan Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Michael Straub	Child	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Samuel Straub	Child	\$8,500,000

Edward W. Straub	Edward Straub	Parent	\$8,500,000
Edward W. Straub	Stanley Straub	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Edward W. Straub	Matthew Straub	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jennifer Tino	Salvatore Tino, Jr.	Parent	\$8,500,000
Jennifer Tino	Jeffrey Tino	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jennifer Tino	Salvatore Tino, III	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Joseph Nicklo	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Mellanie Chase	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	Christopher Barton	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Jeanmarie Wallendorf	John Barton	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Timothy Ward	Estate of Susanne Ward-Baker	Parent	\$8,500,000
William Wilson	Jeanne McDermott	Sibling	\$4,250,000
Marc Scott Zeplin	Debra Zeplin	Spouse	\$12,500,000
Marc Scott Zeplin	Ryan Zeplin	Child	\$8,500,000
Marc Scott Zeplin	Ethan Zeplin	Child	\$8,500,000
TOTAL			\$1,346,375,000;

AND IT IS FURTHERMORE

ORDERED that Plaintiffs shall forthwith serve a copy of this Final Order and Judgment on Compensatory Damages on the Defendants.

This is a final, appealable order. See Fed.R.Civ.P. 54(b); Fed.R.App.P.(4)(a).

SO ORDERED.

DATE: FEB 23 2018
 New York, New York


GEORGE B. DANIELS
 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE